Personality traits and body mass index in Asian populations

Angelina R. Sutin a,⇑, Yannick Stephan b, Lei Wang c,⇑, Shoumin Gao d, Ping Wang d, Antonio Terracciano a

a Florida State University College of Medicine, United States
b University of Montpellier, France
c Department of Psychology, Peking University, China
d No. 1 Senior High School of Tengzhou City, China

A R T I C L E   I N F O

Article history:
Received 12 January 2015
Revised 14 July 2015
Accepted 15 July 2015
Available online 16 July 2015

Keywords:
Five-factor model
Cross-cultural
Adiposity
Body weight
Conscientiousness
Sex differences

A B S T R A C T

Research on personality and adiposity has focused primarily on Western samples; less is known about the personality correlates of BMI in Asian populations. We examined the association between personality and body mass index (BMI) among community-dwelling Japanese adults (N = 380), Chinese adolescents (N = 5882), and a meta-analysis inclusive of a published Korean sample (total N = 10,304). In the new samples and meta-analysis, Extraversion and Agreeableness were associated with higher BMI among men. In contrast to what is often found in Western samples, Conscientiousness was mostly unrelated to adiposity. These findings link pro-social tendencies to overweight among Asian men; Conscientiousness may be less relevant for BMI in Eastern societies with a low prevalence of obesity and strong social norms for eating but not thinness.

1. Introduction

There is a substantial literature that links Conscientiousness to more positive health outcomes (see Friedman, Kern, Hampson, & Duckworth, 2014 for a review). In the case of body mass index (BMI), Conscientiousness tends to be associated with healthier body weight. Individuals with the general tendency to be organized and disciplined are leaner (Terracciano et al., 2009), maintain a more stable weight across adulthood (Lahti et al., 2013; Sutin, Ferrucci, Zonderman, & Terracciano, 2011) and are at lower risk of developing obesity (Jokela et al., 2013) than those who score lower on this trait. This protective association has been documented in American (Chapman, Fiscella, Duberstein, Coletta, & Kawachi, 2009; Sutin et al., 2011), European (Mõttus et al., 2013; Terracciano et al., 2009), Australian (Magee & Heaven, 2011), and Israeli (Armon, Melamed, Shirom, Shapira, & Berliner, 2013) samples. The consistency across populations suggests that Conscientiousness may be a protective factor that transcends culture and environment.

In contrast to Conscientiousness, the association between the four other traits and BMI is less straightforward. Despite the complexity, a pattern of sex differences in the relation between BMI and Neuroticism and Extraversion is starting to emerge: Neuroticism tends to be associated with higher BMI for women but not men, whereas Extraversion tends to be associated with higher BMI for men but not women (Brummett et al., 2006; Sutin & Terracciano, in press); although not all find these sex differences (Magee & Heaven, 2011). Agreeableness has likewise been associated with higher BMI among men in some studies (Chapman et al., 2009) but not others (Magee & Heaven, 2011), whereas Openness tends to be unrelated to BMI for either sex (Chapman et al., 2009; Magee & Heaven, 2011). These sex differences may obscure the relation between these traits and BMI.
associations, although the authors did not test whether sex moderated these associations (neither study measured Conscientiousness).

The provocative findings from Shim and colleagues raise the question of whether the association between Conscientiousness and lower body weight is limited to more Western populations and whether it may not always be protective (Lin, Ma, Wang, & Wang, 2015); little research has addressed this association in Eastern cultures. To that end, the present study examines whether Shim and colleagues’ results extend to samples of community-dwelling Japanese adults and Chinese adolescents. In addition, we meta-analyze our findings with the published literature to estimate their robustness. We expect that the associations between personality and adiposity in the two new samples will be more similar to those of Shim and colleagues than those from Western samples and that the meta-analysis will support these results.

2. Method

2.1. Japanese adult sample: participants and procedure

Data on Japanese adults were drawn from the Survey of Midlife Development in Japan (MIDJA) Biomarker Study. The MIDJA was designed to parallel the Midlife in the United States (MIDUS) study to compare how culture contributes to age differences in health and well-being. A probability sample of Japanese adults was recruited into the study (N = 1027). A subset of the original participants was recruited to complete a biomarker assessment (Markus et al., 2014). To be included in the biomarker assessment, participants had to complete the initial MIDJA assessment and express interest in a clinic visit. Those who agreed (n = 382; Mage = 54.24, SD = 14.11, range 30–79; 56% female) came to a clinic in Tokyo where vital signs, morphometric assessments, and blood assays were obtained. From the total biomarker sample, one participant was excluded because she was pregnant and one participant was missing the personality assessment; the analytic sample size was thus 380. MIDJA data are available for public download here: http://www.icpsr.umich.edu/icpsrweb/ICPSR/studies/34969?q=midja&searchSource=icpsr-landing.

2.2. Chinese adolescent sample: participants and procedure

Participants from two high schools in China were drawn from a larger project on psychological functioning, well-being and achievement across adolescence. Participants (N = 8115) completed a measure of personality as part of the longer questionnaire administered during regular classroom hours. Participants from one of the high schools also had height and weight measurements from a routine health screening at a local hospital. A total of 5882 participants (Mage = 16.78, SD = 1.12, 41% female) had valid personality assessment and measured height and weight.

2.3. Measures

2.3.1. Personality traits

Personality traits in MIDJA were assessed with the Japanese translation of the Midlife Development Inventory (MIDI; Lachman & Weaver, 1997). Participants were asked how much each of 26 adjectives described themselves on a scale ranging from 1 (not at all) to 7 (a lot). Four items assessed Neuroticism (e.g., moody; alpha = .51), five items assessed Extraversion (e.g., talkative; alpha = .83), seven items assessed Openness (e.g., creative; alpha = .84), five items assessed Agreeableness (e.g., sympathetic; alpha = .87), and five items assessed Conscientiousness (e.g., organized; alpha = .66). Personality traits in the Chinese sample were assessed with the Chinese translation of Saucier’s Mini-Marker measure of personality (Saucier, 1994). Participants rated how much each of 40 adjectives (eight for each trait) described themselves on a scale from 1 (not at all) to 7 (a lot). Sample items for each of the traits were the same as those given for the MIDI, and the reliability of each trait was adequate (alpha = .68 for Conscientiousness, .72 for Agreeableness, .76 for Extraversion, and .77 for Neuroticism and Openness).

2.3.2. Adiposity

Participants in MIDJA were measured and weighed by trained staff. Participants in the Chinese adolescent sample were measured as part of a routine health examination. BMI was derived as kg/m². For some analyses, BMI was categorized into overweight/obese (BMI ≥ 25) versus not (i.e., BMI < 25). Overweight was chosen as the threshold because of the low prevalence of obesity in both samples. Waist circumference (MIDJA only) was measured at the narrowest point between the ribs and the iliac crest and recorded to nearest millimeter.

2.4. Statistical approach

In both samples, we used linear regression to examine the association between personality and adiposity. Specifically, we predicted BMI and waist circumference (MIDJA only) from the traits, controlling for age, sex, and education (MIDJA only). Logistic regression was used to predict risk of overweight/obesity from the traits, controlling for the same covariates. Following Shim and colleagues, we ran the regression separately by sex; we also tested sex as a moderator of the personality-BMI relation. To summarize the relation between personality and BMI with the published literature, we performed a random-effect model meta-analysis using the Comprehensive Meta-Analysis software package including the results from Shim and colleagues and the two new samples reported here.¹ Heterogeneity was evaluated using the Q statistic and I². To include the published Korean sample, we did the meta-analysis on the sex-stratified linear analyses. Total N for the meta-analysis was 5154 for males and 5150 for females.

3. Results

The descriptive statistics and bivariate correlations for the Japanese and Chinese samples are given in Tables 1 and 2, respectively. The results of the meta-analysis are reported in Table 3. Tables 4 and 5 report the results of the linear and logistic regressions, respectively. We report the results by trait, with the results of the meta-analysis followed by the results from the samples with new primary data.

3.1. Neuroticism

The meta-analysis revealed no association between Neuroticism and BMI for either men or women. This association diverged between the Japanese and Chinese samples. Consistent with Shim et al. (2014), women in the Japanese sample who had a tendency to experience negative emotions were leaner than women who were more emotionally stable; there was no

¹ Two other studies reported the association between Neuroticism and Extraversion and BMI (Kakizaki et al., 2008; Otonari et al., 2012). These studies, however, did not report the results in a way that could be included in the meta-analysis. We contacted the authors of both papers but were unable to attain the necessary information.
association between Neuroticism and BMI for men. The association between Neuroticism and BMI did not reach the conventional level of significance in the analysis stratified by sex (p = 0.09), but the interaction term was significant when combined in a single analysis ($I^2 = -0.15, p < 0.05$). Neuroticism was also associated with a smaller waist circumference among women but not men in the Japanese sample. In contrast to the Japanese adults, Neuroticism was unrelated to BMI for either sex in the sample of Chinese adolescents. Neuroticism was also unrelated to overweight/obesity risk in either sample.²

² Since there was some evidence that higher Neuroticism was associated with lower weight for women, we did a logistic regression to predict risk of underweight from Neuroticism. It was not significant for the sample of Japanese adults (OR = 1.47, 95% CI = 0.89–2.42) and was in the protective direction for the Chinese adolescents (OR = 0.89, 95% CI = 0.81–0.99).
Table 4
Regression analysis predicting adiposity from personality traits in the total samples and by sex.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Predictor</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>By sex</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japanese adults</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age .15**</td>
<td>.34**</td>
<td></td>
<td>.19**</td>
<td>.39**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex (female) .34</td>
<td>.39</td>
<td></td>
<td>.34**</td>
<td>.39**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education -.02</td>
<td>.02</td>
<td></td>
<td>.03**</td>
<td>.09**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neuroticism -.07</td>
<td>-.12</td>
<td></td>
<td>-.04</td>
<td>-.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extraversion .11</td>
<td>.17</td>
<td></td>
<td>.07**</td>
<td>.16**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Openness .02</td>
<td>.08</td>
<td></td>
<td>-.01</td>
<td>-.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agreeableness .06</td>
<td>.03</td>
<td></td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conscientiousness -.01</td>
<td>-.02</td>
<td></td>
<td>-.02</td>
<td>-.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese adolescents</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 1.08 (.89–1.32)</td>
<td>.90 (.71–1.13)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.60 (1.11–2.32)**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex .25 (.14–.43)**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education .98 (.86–1.11)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neuroticism .86</td>
<td>.99 (.55–1.78)</td>
<td></td>
<td>.71 (.29–1.70)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extraversion 1.57</td>
<td>2.09 (.12–3.33)**</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.01 (.50–2.03)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Openness 1.21 (.54–1.92)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.72 (.79–3.77)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agreeableness 1.35</td>
<td>1.75 (1.02–3.01)**</td>
<td></td>
<td>.91 (.44–1.88)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conscientiousness .98</td>
<td>.91 (.51–1.62)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.23 (.50–3.03)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5
Logistic regression predicting overweight from personality traits.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Predictor</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>By sex</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japanese adults</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 1.04 (.97–1.12)</td>
<td>.90 (.71–1.13)</td>
<td>1.60 (1.11–2.32)**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex .46 (.38–.55)**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neuroticism .96</td>
<td>.96 (.88–1.05)</td>
<td>.94 (.81–1.09)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extraversion 1.23</td>
<td>1.28 (1.16–1.41)**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Openness 1.12</td>
<td>1.08 (.99–1.19)</td>
<td>1.21 (1.03–1.43)**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agreeableness 1.09</td>
<td>1.12 (1.02–1.23)</td>
<td>1.02 (.87–1.20)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conscientiousness .98</td>
<td>.97 (.86–1.07)</td>
<td>1.02 (.86–1.19)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chinese adolescents
Age 1.04 (.97–1.12) 1.06 (.97–1.15) 1.00 (.87–1.15)
Sex .46 (.38–.55)**
Personality
Neuroticism .96 (.89–1.03) .96 (.88–1.05) .94 (.81–1.09)
Extraversion 1.23 (1.13–1.33)** 1.28 (1.16–1.41)** 1.12 (.97–1.30)
Openness 1.12 (1.03–1.21)** 1.08 (.99–1.19) 1.21 (1.03–1.43)**
Agreeableness 1.09 (1.01–1.18) 1.12 (1.02–1.23) 1.02 (.87–1.20)
Conscientiousness .98 (.90–1.06) .97 (.86–1.07) 1.02 (.86–1.19)

Note. N = 380 for the total sample of Japanese adults, n = 167 for male and n = 213 for female. N = 5882 for the total sample of Chinese adolescents; n = 3492 for male and n = 2390 for female. Coefficients are standardized beta coefficients from linear regression.

* p < .05.
** p < .01.

3.2. Extraversion

The sex difference in the relation between Extraversion and BMI was consistent across the samples and in the meta-analysis: Men with a tendency to be outgoing and social had higher BMI, an association not apparent among women. When combined in a single analysis, the interaction with sex was significant in the Chinese sample (β = -.06, p < .01) and in the expected direction in the Japanese sample, but not significant (β = -.10, p = .18). Extraversion was likewise more strongly related to a larger waist circumference for men than women in the Japanese sample and was associated with greater risk of overweight/obesity in both samples.

3.3. Openness

There was no relation between Openness and BMI in the meta-analysis or in either of the two new samples. Although not apparent in the continuous analysis, Openness was associated with risk of overweight/obesity among female Chinese adolescents.

3.4. Agreeableness

Although only significant in the Chinese sample, the meta-analysis revealed a small positive association between Agreeableness and BMI for males: Men who scored higher on Agreeableness tended to have higher BMI, a relation not apparent among women. The interaction with sex was significant in the Chinese sample (β = -.04, p < .05). There was a similar pattern in the Japanese sample for both BMI and waist circumference, but neither interaction with sex was significant. Finally, Agreeableness was associated with greater risk of overweight/obesity for men but not women in both samples.

3.5. Conscientiousness

Conscientiousness was unrelated to BMI for either sex in the meta-analysis. There was no relation with BMI or waist circumference in either sex in the Japanese sample. In the sample of Chinese adolescents, Conscientiousness was unrelated to BMI in the total sample, but there was a significant negative association among

females. The interaction with sex, however, was not significant ($f_{ic \times sex} = -.02, p = .22$). Conscientiousness was unrelated to risk of overweight/obesity.

4. Discussion

In two samples from Asia, the personality correlates of body weight differed somewhat from the pattern typically found in Western populations. Most striking, Conscientiousness was unrelated to BMI. Across both samples, however, Extraversion was associated with higher BMI among men than women. The meta-analysis with the only other published study of all five FFM personality traits in an Asian sample supported these associations and also indicated a positive association between Agreeableness and BMI for men. The meta-analysis did not support an association between Neuroticism and BMI for either sex. This evidence from East-Asian samples suggests that some personality correlates of weight may differ between Eastern and Western cultures and that the association between Conscientiousness and healthier weight may not be universal.

The literature on personality and BMI tends to show that individuals who are Conscientious are leaner and at lower risk of obesity (Jokela et al., 2013). The majority of these studies, however, focus on Western populations that have different attitudes about eating. For example, the Japanese tend to savor the culinary experience whereas Americans worry about the nutritional content of the food (Rozin, Fischer, Imada, Sarubin, & Wrzesniewski, 1999). In addition, different social norms around food and eating may make Conscientiousness less relevant for adiposity in Asia compared to the United States. That is, when behavior is regulated by external factors, such as cultural norms, there may be less of a need to self-regulate (De Ridder, De Vet, Stok, Adriaanse, & De Wit, 2013). In contrast, when there are no strong social norms and individuals have more choice about what, when, and how much to eat, Conscientiousness may contribute to maintaining a stable weight and protect against obesity.

This difference may also be shaped by differences in prevalence across cultures. That is, countries in Asia have among the lowest prevalence of obesity in the world, with less than <5% of the adult population in China, Japan and South Korea estimated to be obese (OECD, 2013). By contrast, 35% of the American adult population is estimated to be obese (Ogden, Carroll, Kit, & Flegal, 2014). As such, there may be not be enough variance in body weight to be associated with Conscientiousness. One association with Conscientiousness did emerge in the expected direction: adolescent girls in China who scored higher in Conscientiousness had lower BMI. China is undergoing rapid urbanization and with it rapid growth in childhood obesity in urban areas (Zhang, Zhao, & Chu, 2014). As cities become more Western, the traits associated with healthier weight in the west may become more relevant. As obesity rises in China, social awareness and emphasis on thinness (for both aesthetic and for health reasons) are likely to increase as well. Individuals who are more Conscientious are likely to devote their attention and discipline toward the goal of avoiding excess weight and adhere to norms for thinness. The small association in the Chinese girls is likely to spread to men and become stronger as the prevalence of obesity increases, along with the denigration and stigmatization of excess weight typical in Western cultures.

Even with this restricted range, however, other traits were associated with adiposity. In particular, the stronger association between Extraversion and BMI among men is consistent with a growing literature that indicates that men who are sociable and outgoing tend to weigh more, whereas this association is less apparent among women (e.g., Brummett et al., 2006; Jokela et al., 2013; Shim et al., 2014; Sutin & Terracciano, in press). When eating in a group, individuals tend to consume more food and drink than when by themselves (Hetherington, Anderson, Norton, & Newson, 2006), and Extraversion has been associated with eating more in response to external (e.g., social) cues (Keller & Siegrist, 2014). Surprisingly, this association may be more common across cultures than the association between Conscientiousness and BMI. In addition to Extraversion, the meta-analysis also revealed a small positive association between Agreeableness and higher BMI among males. Together with the Extraversion relation, it suggests that males who are more socially skilled in Asia are also more likely to have a higher BMI. Given the modest nature of the association, however, it needs to be replicated before drawing any firm conclusions from it.

The association between Neuroticism and BMI remains unclear. Similar to the South Korean sample, Neuroticism was associated with lower BMI among women compared to men in the Japanese sample. Two other published studies also suggest a negative association between Neuroticism and BMI in Japanese populations (Kakizaki et al., 2008; Otonari et al., 2012), which is opposite to what is found in American samples (e.g., Brummett et al., 2006; Sutin et al., 2011). Women in the United States are more likely to report eating for emotional reasons than women in Japan (Hawks, Madanat, Merrill, Goudy, & Miyagawa, 2003), which suggests that women high in Neuroticism in the United States may be more likely to regulate their emotions with food than women high in Neuroticism in Japan. Neuroticism was, however, unrelated to BMI among the Chinese adolescents. It is unclear whether this difference is due to developmental reasons (i.e., Neuroticism matters more for BMI in adulthood than adolescence), cultural differences (i.e., Neuroticism matters less for individuals from China than Japan), or whether any relation is due to chance.

The present research has several strengths, including two community-dwelling samples covering both adolescence and adulthood, validated measures of the five-factor model of personality, and staff assessed measurements of adiposity. The results were consistent across BMI and waist circumference in the Japanese sample, and across analytic methods (continuous and dichotomous BMI) in both samples. The meta-analysis provided a summary of the available literature on BMI and the five major dimensions of personality in Asian samples. There were also some limitations that could be addressed in future research. First, the measure of personality assessed only the broad domains; it would be worthwhile to use a more detailed personality measure to be able to examine more specific facets of personality, in addition to the domains. Second, the alpha reliabilities for Neuroticism and Conscientiousness were somewhat low, which may have attenuated the results. Third, the data were cross-sectional; we were thus unable to examine whether there were any bi-directional associations between personality and body weight, as has been shown in other samples (Sutin et al., 2013). Finally, as with any cross-cultural research, caution should also be used when interpreting the results of associations from different cultural contexts.

In sum, the present research suggests that the personality correlates of BMI in Asian populations differ somewhat from that of more Western samples; specifically, Conscientiousness was surprisingly unrelated to BMI. It has long been argued that behavior is the product of the interaction of personality with the environment. Culture may be one aspect of the environment that interacts with personality to produce different correlates across populations. More systematic investigations of the role of personality in health across cultures are needed to identify how culture shapes the expression of personality to predict important outcomes.

Acknowledgements

This research was supported by a grant from the Eunice Kennedy Shriver National Institute of Child Heath and Human...
Development (1R15HD083947) to Angelina R. Sutin. The study of adolescent development in China was supported by NSF Grant #91324201. The Survey of Midlife Development in Japan (MIDJA) was supported by the National Institute on Aging (5R37AG027343).

References


